

Ref.: CL/4068

Subject: Preliminary Report accompanied by a first draft of the

Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education

and Training

Sir/Madam,

The General Conference of UNESCO decided at its 37th session in November 2013 (37 C/Resolution 17) that the 2001 Revised Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education should be revised to reflect the new trends and issues in technical and vocational education and training (TVET).

In accordance with the Rules of Procedure concerning recommendations to Member States and international conventions covered by the terms of Article IV, paragraph 4, of the Constitution, please find herewith the Preliminary Report accompanied by a first draft of the Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education and Training.

In conformity with these Rules of Procedure, Member States shall forward to the Secretariat of UNESCO their comments and observations at least ten months before the opening of the 38th session of the General Conference. Therefore, I would be grateful if these could be sent by 10 January 2015 to the UNESCO Section of Youth, Literacy and Skills Development at the following email address: 2001revision@unesco.org.

Please accept, Sir/Madam, the assurances of my highest consideration.

Irina Bokova Director-General

Enclosures: 2

- 1. Preliminary report of the Director-General on the draft Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education and Training
- 2. First draft of the Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education and Training

cc: National Commissions for UNESCO Permanent Delegations to UNESCO UNESCO Regional and field offices

#### **ANNEX I**

# REVISION OF THE REVISED RECOMMENDATION CONCERNING TECHNICAL AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION (2001)

Preliminary report prepared in accordance with Article 10.1 of the Rules of Procedure concerning recommendations to Member States and international conventions covered by the terms of Article IV, paragraph 4, of the Constitution, on the draft Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education and Training

#### **SUMMARY**

The General Conference of UNESCO decided at its 37th session in November 2013 (37 C/Resolution 17) that the 2001 Revised Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education should be revised to reflect the new trends and issues in technical and vocational education and training.

In accordance with Article 10, paragraph 1, of the Rules of Procedure concerning recommendations to Member States and international conventions covered by the terms of Article IV, paragraph 4, of the Constitution, the Director-General has prepared the present preliminary report, to which a first draft of the Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education and Training is annexed.

The preliminary report and a first draft text are submitted to Member States for their comments and observations, to be forwarded to the Secretariat of UNESCO by 10 January 2015. A final report containing a draft text will be prepared on the basis of those comments and observations. It will be communicated to Member States by April 2015, with a view to its discussion at the 38th session of the General Conference.

# I. Background

- 1. UNESCO is responsible for monitoring the implementation of two normative instruments in the field of technical and vocational education and training (TVET): the 1989 Convention on Technical and Vocational Education; and the 2001 Revised Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education (henceforth the 2001 Revised Recommendation). The 1989 Convention was adopted by the 25th session of the General Conference (1989) two years after the International Congress on the Improvement and Development of TVET (Berlin, 1987). The Recommendation was originally adopted by the 12th session of the General Conference of UNESCO (1962). It was revised in 1974 and again in 2001, following the Second International Congress on Technical and Vocational Education (Seoul, 1999).
- 2. In 2011, an independent study on the impact of these two normative instruments was conducted, as foreseen by the UNESCO Strategy for TVET (2010-2015). Upon examining the results of the study presented in document 187 EX/20 (Part IV),<sup>2</sup> the Executive Board requested the Director-General to include in the Third International Congress on TVET (Shanghai, May 2012) a discussion on the content, relevance and scope of the normative instruments concerning TVET.

http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0014/001406/140603e.pdf

http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0021/002109/210904e.pdf

- 3. The "Shanghai Consensus" adopted by the Congress recommended the Director-General to "consider the relevance and currency of the Convention on Technical and Vocational Education (1989) and the Revised Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education (2001), with a view to the possible development of new or revised normative instruments adapted to a changing world".
- 4. Based on the findings of the independent study and the "Shanghai Consensus", the Executive Board, by 190 EX/Decision 24 (III),<sup>4</sup> requested the Director-General to submit to it a preliminary study on the technical and legal aspects relating to the desirability of making further revisions to the 2001 Revised Recommendation.
- 5. Having examined this preliminary study (document 191 EX/20 (Part III)),<sup>5</sup> the Executive Board reiterated the need to revise the 2001 Revised Recommendation and decided to inscribe this item on the provisional agenda of the 37th session of the General Conference, while inviting the Director-General to submit to the 37th session of the General Conference the preliminary study on the technical and legal aspects relating to the desirability of making further revisions to the 2001 Revised Recommendation, together with the relevant observations, comments and decisions of the Executive Board (191 EX/Decision 20 (III)).<sup>6</sup>
- 6. Pursuant to 191 EX/Decision 20 (III) and in accordance with the Rules of Procedure concerning recommendations to Member States and international conventions covered by the terms of Article IV, paragraph 4 of the Constitution, the Director-General submitted a preliminary study on the technical and legal aspects relating to the desirability of revising the 2001 Revised Recommendation to the 37th session of the General Conference in November 2013 (document 37 C/44).
- 7. Having examined this preliminary study, the General Conference of UNESCO decided at its 37th session in November 2013 (37 C/Resolution 17)<sup>8</sup> that the 2001 Revised Recommendation should be revised once more to reflect the new trends and issues in technical and vocational education and training; invited the Director-General to prepare such a revised version in consultation with the Member States and other stakeholders through various cost-effective measures, without convening the special committee referred to in Article 10, paragraphs 4 and 5, of the Rules of Procedure concerning recommendations to Member States and international conventions covered by the terms of Article IV, paragraph 4, of the Constitution; and also invited the Director-General to submit to it, at its 38th session, a draft revised Recommendation.

## II. Revision process

3

- 8. The preliminary study on the technical and legal aspects relating to the desirability of revising the 2001 Revised Recommendation indicated that the Director-General would conduct consultations and solicit the comments and observations of all Member States and from other relevant actors such as regional and international organizations, in particular the International Labour Organization, and national legal and technical experts.
- 9. Several important steps of the consultation and drafting process have already taken place, including through electronic platforms and an experts' meeting. A Special Virtual Conference was organized by UNESCO-UNEVOC from 1 to 14 April 2014, using the e-forum. The objective of this Special Virtual Conference was to re-examine the conceptualization of TVET and its various

http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0021/002176/217683e.pdf

http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0021/002181/218189e.pdf

http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0021/002198/219823e.pdf

http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0022/002207/220725e.pdf

http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0022/002226/222614e.pdf

http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0022/002261/226162e.pdf

contributions towards fulfilling UNESCO's mandate for promoting lasting peace and sustainable development. The discussion focused on the changes that needed to be made to the 2001 Revised Recommendation for the instrument to remain current. The Special Virtual Conference attracted 210 participants from 70 countries, including staff of government ministries, TVET agencies, international organizations, official bilateral agencies, non-governmental organizations, universities and public and private TVET providers.

- 10. Based on the outcomes of this Special Virtual Conference and informed by the actions undertaken by the Organization in the framework of the Strategy for TVET and the mid-term review of the Strategy for TVET, the Secretariat developed a revised text that was shared for feedback with an Expert Group on TVET established specifically to advise the Secretariat on the revisions. The Expert Group on TVET comprised representatives from the UNEVOC Network, ILO and international social partners.
- 11. A Joint Expert Meeting, comprised of the Expert Group on TVET and the Expert Group on Adult Learning and Education, was held in Hamburg on 27 and 28 May 2014. The Joint Expert Meeting on the UNESCO Recommendations concerning Technical and Vocational Education and Adult Learning and Education, held at the UNESCO Institute for Lifelong Learning (UIL), aimed to ensure that the revised instruments will be mutually reinforcing and address contemporary issues in a harmonious manner. One of the outcomes of the Joint Expert Meeting was a revised draft text that was the main focus of an Online Consultation with Member States and other stakeholders held from 1 to 8 July 2014 using UNESCO's collaborative platform, "UNESTEAMS".
- 12. The objective of this Online Consultation was for participants to review this draft text of the Recommendation, and the focus of the discussion was on the changes needed prior to its submission to Member States in accordance with Article 10, paragraph 1, of the Rules of Procedure concerning recommendations to Member States and international conventions covered by the terms of Article IV, paragraph 4, of the Constitution. Participants in the Online Consultation included legal and senior experts on TVET nominated by UNESCO Member States and Associate Members from all regional groups (187 nominated experts, representing 99 countries), and representatives of international organizations and development partners (17) and of NGOs (11). Over the eight days, 97 participants contributed actively to the three discussion fora (English, French and Spanish), providing over 900 inputs. These written inputs were used to inform the further elaboration by the Secretariat of the first draft text of the Recommendation, which is hereto annexed for Member States' comments and observations.

## III. Focus of the revision

- 13. This first draft text reflects conceptual and policy developments that stress the need for a more integrated approach towards education and training, a holistic approach to the preparation for work and life, and the development of lifelong learning systems.
- 14. The scope of this first draft text is broader than that of the 2001 text. For instance, the "training" dimension has been added to "technical and vocational education", so that it becomes "technical and vocational education and training". In keeping with recent discussions on education beyond 2015, this first draft text is oriented towards promoting "skills for work and life" and ensuring that all young people and adults have equal opportunities to learn, develop and upgrade their skills. The text integrates a stronger focus on lifelong learning, by promoting a transversal dimension for the development of knowledge, skills and attitudes across the education and training sector and in support of capacities in other sectors.

- 15. To address the rapid demographic and technological changes that are taking place and the deepening concerns relating to youth unemployment, underemployment, social inequalities including gender inequality, peace and sustainable development, this first draft text encourages Member States to adopt a more integrated, inter-sectoral approach to policy development, implementation, and monitoring and evaluation, and to address critical issues such as qualifications and learning pathways, quality assurance systems and labour market relevance.
- 16. This first draft text also addresses the complexity of governing TVET by encouraging necessary inter-ministerial coordination, partnerships and the mobilization of all stakeholders, giving special attention to the role of social partners, the private sector and civil society, such as youth organizations.
- 17. With a view to rendering this standard-setting instrument more effective and to facilitate its monitoring, this first draft text takes on a more concise form than the 2001 Revised Recommendation. This first draft of the Recommendation consists of eight main sections:
  - o Preamble
  - o Scope of this Recommendation
  - o Vision, aims and guiding principles
  - o Policies and stakeholders' involvement
  - o Quality and relevance
  - o Monitoring and evaluation
  - o Research and knowledge management
  - o International cooperation
- 18. Taking into account the prominent place of TVET and skills development for employment and livelihoods in the emerging post-2015 international education and development agendas and goals, Member States are now invited to forward their comments and observations on this preliminary report and the first draft text annexed hereto to the Secretariat of UNESCO by 10 January 2015. A final report containing a draft text of the Recommendation will be prepared on the basis of those comments and observations, and communicated to Member States by April 2015, with a view to its discussion at the 38th session of the General Conference.

## ANNEX II

## FIRST DRAFT TEXT

# RECOMMENDATION CONCERNING TECHNICAL AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING (TVET)

## **Preamble**

The General Conference of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), meeting in Paris, (...), at its 38th session,

**Recalling** the principles set forth in Articles 23 and 26 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948) and in Articles 6(2) and 13 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1966) guaranteeing the right of everyone to work and to education, and the principles contained in the Convention Against Discrimination in Education (1960), the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (1979), the Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989) and the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (2006),

**Conscious** that TVET is understood as being part of both the right to education and the right to work,

**Recognizing** that TVET meets the "aim of developing both individuals and societies" as stipulated in the Convention on Technical and Vocational Education (1989),

**Recalling** the provisions of the Recommendations adopted by UNESCO, notably the Recommendation against Discrimination in Education (1960), the Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers (1966), the Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (1974), the Recommendation on the Recognition of Studies and Qualifications in Higher Education (1993), the Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher-Education Teaching Personnel (1997) and the Recommendation on Adult Learning and Education (2015),

**Recalling** also the relevant instruments adopted by the International Labour Organization (ILO) including the 1975 Convention concerning Vocational Guidance and Vocational Training in the Development of Human Resources (No. 142) and the 2004 Recommendation concerning Human Resources Development: Education, training and lifelong learning (No. 195),

**Recognizing** that TVET contributes towards the promotion of understanding and respect for human rights; inclusion and equity; gender equality, cultural diversity; and to the fostering of a desire and capacity for lifelong learning and learning to live together, all of which are essential to the realization of lasting peace, responsible citizenship, and sustainable development,

**Bearing in mind** the key role of TVET in supporting the United Nations' sustainable development agenda in the context of States striving for a world that is just, equitable and inclusive, and their commitment to the promotion of social development, shared economic growth and environmental sustainability, and thereby to benefit all,

**Considering** the need to promote gender-responsive TVET and to further encourage the access, retention and completion of girls and women,

**Taking into account** the recommendations of the Bonn Declaration on Learning for Work, Citizenship and Sustainability (2004), the Bonn Declaration on Education for Sustainable

Development (2009), the recommendations of the Third International Congress on TVET, "Transforming TVET: Building skills for work and life", known as the Shanghai Consensus (2012),

*Having decided* by 37 C/Resolution 17 that the 2001 Revised Recommendation should be revised to reflect the new trends and issues in technical and vocational education and training,

**Considering** that this Recommendation sets out general principles, goals and guidelines that each Member State should apply according to its socio-economic context, governing structures and available resources in a changing world, with a view also to transforming, expanding and enhancing TVET at local, regional and international levels,

*Having examined* document 38 C/... and the draft Recommendation concerning technical and vocational education and training annexed thereto,

- 1. Adopts the Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education and Training, which supersedes the 2001 Revised Recommendation, on this .... day of November 2015;
- 2. Recommends that Member States apply the following provisions by taking appropriate steps, including whatever legislative or other steps may be required, in conformity with the constitutional practice and governing structures of each State, to give effect within their territories to the principles of this Recommendation;
- 3. Also recommends that Member States bring this Recommendation to the attention of the authorities and bodies responsible for TVET, and also other stakeholders concerned with TVET;
- 4. Further recommends that Member States report to it, at such dates and in such manner as shall be determined by it, on the action taken by them in pursuance of this Recommendation.

## I. SCOPE OF THIS RECOMMENDATION

- 1. This Recommendation applies to all forms of education and learning that aim to facilitate access and participation by all youth and adults in the world of work and lifelong learning.
- 2. For the purpose of this Recommendation, "technical and vocational education and training" (TVET) is understood to be integral to education and lifelong learning and to refer to all forms of learning of knowledge, skills and attitudes relating to the world of work. TVET comprises education, training and skills development activities relating to occupational fields, production and livelihoods. Transversal skills, citizenship skills and skills that enable lifelong learning are integral components of TVET.
- 3. TVET involves a wide variety of learning and skills development opportunities. It can take place at secondary, post-secondary and tertiary levels. TVET can include other programmes leading to vocational qualifications and other skills development opportunities attuned to national and local contexts. TVET also encompasses continuing training and professional development undertaken as part of in-service arrangements or individual and collective initiatives.
- 4. The application of the provisions of this Recommendation will depend upon the specific conditions, governing structures, and constitutional provisions existing in a given country.

# II. VISION, AIMS AND GUIDING PRINCIPLES

## Vision

5. TVET empowers individuals for their fulfilment and the sustainability of their societies.

## **Aims**

- 6. TVET will effectively help individuals to achieve their own aspirations for work and life.
- 7. TVET will contribute to meeting the collective needs of society and the demands of the world of work.

# **Guiding principles**

- 8. TVET is located between economic, social, environmental and other inter-related policy domains. An integrated, inter-sectoral approach to policy development is required to transform and expand TVET so as to realize the vision and aims of this Recommendation. This implies the integrated analysis of contexts and close collaboration between government ministries, authorities, institutions, social partners and numerous other stakeholders.
- 9. As a means of advancing shared economic growth, TVET should adapt to changes in the nature and organization of work, including increasing flexibility in employment relations and in the labour market, the emergence of new industries and occupations, and scientific and technological advances. TVET is characterized by its proximity to the world of work and should promote entrepreneurship and transitions, interactions and integration between learning and working.
- 10. As a means of ensuring the right of equal access to TVET, education and training systems should be non-discriminatory and inclusive, contributing towards the achievement of gender equality, equal opportunities, social equity and social inclusion. No individual seeking access to TVET shall be discriminated against on any grounds. Recognizing that TVET can help to alleviate poverty and social exclusion, particular consideration should be given to disadvantaged and vulnerable groups, including individuals with disabilities. TVET should be relevant to all populations, whether living in urban or rural areas, including indigenous people. As such, TVET should contribute to ensuring quality, equitable and inclusive lifelong learning opportunities for all.
- 11. As a means of contributing to sustainable development, TVET should be reoriented to empower youth and adults to become constructive agents of sustainable development, and thus to advocate for sustainability at work, in households, communities and societies. Furthermore, TVET should contribute to cultural development, social cohesion and lasting peace through fostering respect for cultural diversity, democratic participation and responsible citizenship, including the development of capacities to act collaboratively and to strive for the collective good.
- 12. While being integral to education and lifelong learning, TVET should contribute to the development of knowledge, skills and attitudes in a wide range of occupational and technical fields needed for advancement in all sectors and for sustainable development in all its aspects. TVET should in particular take account of the rapidly developing and transforming nature of technologies, especially information technologies.

## III. POLICIES AND STAKEHOLDERS' INVOLVEMENT

# Policy coherence and stakeholders' involvement

- 13. TVET policies should derive from and be consistent with a broad range of policy fields and the overall strategic objectives of government, including economic, social and environmental objectives.
- 14. Member States should guide, recognize and promote all forms and settings of TVET through an overall lifelong learning framework that should be oriented to producing better outcomes for youth and adults in the world of work, equipping them with relevant knowledge, skills and attitudes for work and life, and providing support for them to make informed educational and occupational choices.
- 15. Member States expanding TVET at secondary level should consider, as appropriate to their education and training systems and authorities, the diversification of secondary education curricula and the development of pathways between different streams.
- 16. Member States and/or TVET institutions expanding TVET at post-secondary and tertiary levels should ensure that there is an institutional framework to engage labour market stakeholders, that programmes and qualifications are transparent and quality assured, and that curricula follow agreed standards.
- 17. Member States should develop pathways between secondary, post-secondary and tertiary education including admission procedures and counselling, credit transfer and equivalency schemes. TVET institutions should collaborate on their implementation.
- 18. Member States should develop relevant regulations and incentives to support professional and personal development, information, guidance and counselling.
- 19. Member States should support continuing education and training, including through the recognition of prior learning, assessment and certification with the tripartite involvement, when relevant, of workers' representatives, employers' representatives and public authorities.

# **Governance and regulatory framework**

- 20. Member States, while assuming the responsibility for public policies, should consider defining or strengthening a regulatory or policy framework regarding responsibilities, authorities and accountability to coordinate TVET for the benefit of all stakeholders, and encourage legislation supporting participation. Member States should strengthen technical, administrative and institutional capacities for the governance and management of TVET. TVET funding should be considered an integral aspect of TVET governance and steering.
- 21. Member States, as appropriate to their governing structures, should institutionalize interministerial coordination and align different levels of government.
- 22. Governance arrangements should be reflected at local levels, where governments channel funds and cooperate, when relevant, with business associations in running TVET institutions and supporting work-based learning.
- 23. In conformity with the constitutional practice and governing structures of each Member State, and utilizing appropriate structures such as public agencies or consultative bodies, public authorities responsible for planning, overseeing and implementing TVET should associate the following groups actively in the governance process:

- o representatives of employers', producers' and workers' organizations, industry, agriculture, crafts associations and chambers as well as of the informal economy, small enterprise owners and entrepreneurs;
- o representatives of learners; and
- o representatives of the community at large such as non-governmental organizations, youth and women's organizations, parents' associations, traditional leaders and other representatives.
- 24. Member States, as appropriate to their governing structures, should consider establishing or strengthening governance models for TVET institutions involving relevant local stakeholders.
- 25. Member States should develop a culture of collaboration in TVET, through knowledge-sharing within and between development sectors.

# Involving the private sector and promoting social dialogue

- 26. Private sector participation in TVET should be guided by key principles including alignment with public policies, support to social dialogue, responsibility, accountability and efficiency.
- 27. When involving the private sector, TVET policies should recognize the diversity of large, medium, small, micro- and household enterprises engaged in all sectors of the economy, formal and informal, including farm and non-farm enterprises in rural areas, producers' organizations and informal organizations of rural workers.
- 28. Member States should, as appropriate to their labour market context, foster social partners' participation in TVET. Social partners should be entitled to participate in TVET according to agreed regulations and appropriate lines of responsibility.
- 29. Involving the private sector, in particular through business associations and producers' organizations, trade unions and other labour market stakeholders, and the building of partnerships are critical to ensuring responsive and relevant TVET. Partnerships for TVET should benefit from the participation of stakeholders in the following areas:
  - o TVET system planning, governance, regulatory framework and financing;
  - skills forecasting and analysis and the definition of occupational profiles;
  - o the development of TVET curricula, and the definition of TVET qualifications and standards;
  - o the management of TVET institutions; and
  - o assessment, validation and certification and diverse other functions, including promotion of innovations, participation in labour market research and applied research, contribution to professional guidance and TVET staff training and development.
- 30. Public policies should foster and facilitate quality apprenticeships composed of work-and institution-based learning driven by robust social dialogue, to promote consensus building, as well as public-private partnerships to help youth to acquire skills and gain work experience to facilitate transitions to the world of work.
- 31. Public policies should, as appropriate, support the development of skills in the informal economy by encouraging skills development including quality traditional apprenticeship in small, micro- and household enterprises. Public policies should engage agriculture, industry,

cultural and crafts associations to play a significant role in improving the quality of learning, assessment and certification.

# Financing

- 32. Incentive mechanisms and regulatory frameworks should be set up to diversify sources of funding and involve all stakeholders. Diversification should be considered by engaging enterprises, individuals and local authorities through a variety of partnerships, including public-private partnerships. In addition to existing frameworks for public financing, innovative funding mechanisms need to be explored to increase efficiency and accountability and to stimulate the demand for TVET.
- 33. Sustainable funding mechanisms and methodologies for the allocation and use of financial resources should be put in place. Various forms of incentives and accountability mechanisms should be established aiming at shifting the traditional input-based models to more performance-based financing ones.
- 34. TVET institutions, including at the secondary, post-secondary and tertiary levels, should have an appropriate level of operational and financial autonomy. This could enable them to engage with their local context and to build new partnerships for improving the quality and relevance of TVET programmes, and to generate revenues.

# **Equity and access**

- 35. Member States should take measures to ensure that all young people and adults have equal opportunities to learn, develop and upgrade their skills, by transforming and expanding TVET in all its forms to address the great diversity of learning and training needs.
- 36. Member States, as appropriate to their governing structures, should ensure a quality basic education for all, and address the needs of out-of-school youth and adults by enhancing literacy, numeracy and transversal skills, as a basis for meaningful participation in TVET.
- 37. Education and other stakeholders should create the conditions for TVET for all, so that it may be freely chosen as the means to develop talents, interests and skills leading to work and/or further learning.
- 38. Innovative measures should be taken against all forms of discrimination, including gender-based discrimination. TVET should promote equal access and participation of females and males in quality TVET learning throughout life. All forms of TVET institutions, programmes, curricula, materials and work-based learning should avoid gender-based and other stereotyping, and should contribute to gender equality.
- 39. Member States should make TVET more accessible to disadvantaged and vulnerable groups, including marginalized rural and remote populations, by providing targeted support to reduce the cost burden. Particular attention should be given to learners with disabilities, indigenous people, ethnic minority groups, the socially-excluded, migrants, refugees, the stateless and those affected by conflict or disaster, as well as to unemployed people, low-skilled people, older workers and workers in small and medium-sized enterprises, in the informal economy, the rural sector and self-employment.
- 40. Information technologies, supported by a relevant infrastructure, should be encouraged, as appropriate to different contexts, to improve access to and participation in TVET.

## IV. QUALITY AND RELEVANCE

## Learning processes

- 41. A variety of learning experiences should be encouraged, whether in public and private TVET institutions, workplaces, homes, or other situations. Informal learning, whether self-directed, peer-to-peer or through other forms of social learning, should be supported and, if appropriate, made visible in terms that are recognized by formal TVET institutions and in the world of work.
- 42. In addition to knowledge, skills and attitudes relating to occupational fields, learning processes should build on foundation skills and further deepen understandings of the scientific, technological, social, cultural, environmental and economic aspects of societies. TVET should develop transversal and entrepreneurial skills, skills for health, responsible citizenship and sustainable development.
- 43. Learning through work in its various forms, including apprenticeships, should be promoted and its quality enhanced. Learning through work should normally be complemented by institution-based or other forms of learning.
- 44. Technologies, including the internet, interactive multimedia materials, audiovisual aids, mass media and social media, should be utilized to enhance the cost-effectiveness and quality of TVET programmes. Distance and face-to-face modes should preferably be blended.
- 45. Effective assessment systems for generating and using information on learners' achievements should be established. Continuous evaluation of teaching and learning processes, including formative assessment, should be undertaken with the participation of teachers, representatives of the occupational fields concerned, supervisors and learners. Learners' performance should be assessed on an overall basis that considers active participation in learning, interests and attitudes, using diversified methods of assessment.

## **TVET staff**

- 46. Policies and frameworks should be developed to ensure qualified and high-quality TVET staff, including teachers, instructors, trainers, tutors, managers, administrators, extension agents and guidance staff.
- 47. TVET teachers should be considered an integral part of the teaching profession. The ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers (1966) and the Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher-Education Teaching Personnel (1997) are applicable especially as regards the provisions concerning preparation for a profession, continuing education, employment and career, the rights and responsibilities of teachers, conditions for effective teaching and learning, teachers' salaries and social security. Member States thus should consider devising strategies and providing incentives, including attractive remuneration, career paths and professional development.
- 48. Given the growing consideration of TVET learning in the workplace and other settings including community-based, distance and online, Member States need to more systematically support and acknowledge the emerging roles and learning needs of workplace trainers, tutors and other facilitators, by considering the development or strengthening of policies and frameworks concerning their recruitment and/or status. TVET staff should have decent working conditions and adequate remuneration.
- 49. TVET staff in educational institutions and the workplace should be equipped with the capacities required to make TVET responsive to the economic, social, cultural and environmental contexts of the societies they serve. In particular, TVET staff require initial preparation, as well as continuing training programmes and continuing professional

development, including experience in enterprises, and support to enable them to reflect on their practices and to adapt to changing conditions. Gender sensitivity training should be an integral part of the initial and continuing professional development of TVET staff.

# Qualifications systems and learning pathways

- 50. Well-articulated outcome-based qualifications frameworks or systems based on learning outcomes and relating to a set of agreed standards should be established based on identified needs including occupational standards, enabling people to progress horizontally and vertically.
- 51. Policy mechanisms supporting horizontal and vertical progress could include flexible learning pathways, the recognition of prior learning, credit transfer and setting adequate incentives. Special attention should be given to assisting low-skilled and unskilled individuals to gain certification for access to further learning and decent work.
- 52. Systems for the recognition, validation and accreditation of knowledge, skills and attitudes through non-formal and informal learning should be promoted. UNESCO's Guidelines for the Recognition, Validation and Accreditation of the Outcomes of Non-formal and Informal Learning could be referred to in this regard.
- 53. Member States should promote the mutual recognition of qualifications at national, regional and international levels, considering the international dimension of qualifications in relation to the mobility of students and workers.

# **Quality assurance**

- 54. Quality assurance should designate and bring together all of the bodies that have a role in the management of quality in TVET. Quality assurance refers to a wide range of norms, requirements and procedures that are intended to establish a culture and procedures for external- and/or self-assessment, through which system performance and outcomes can be continuously improved.
- 55. Quality assurance systems should include clear and measurable objectives and standards; guidelines for implementation, including stakeholders' involvement; appropriate resources; consistent evaluation methods, associating self-assessment and external review; and feedback mechanisms and procedures for improvement and widely-accessible evaluation results.

## Relevance to labour markets and the world of work

- 56. Member States should take appropriate actions to improve the relevance of TVET to changes in labour markets and the world of work. Institutional capacities for the analysis of specific contexts need to be strengthened so that TVET can respond rapidly to changing skills needs, through policy and planning, and in relation to economic sectors, for example through sector skills councils, and at the level of providers.
- 57. Capacities should be developed to anticipate emerging needs, such as those implied by transitions to green economies and societies. Fostering linkages with industry and the adoption of sectoral and/or territorial approaches could be used to identify and anticipate skills needed.
- 58. Labour market analysis should take into consideration the implications, benefits and drawbacks of increasing labour market flexibility, including more part-time working, short contracts, frequent employment transitions, multiple occupations, and periods of unemployment and underemployment, migration and mobility.

- 59. Data collection and analysis systems to assess the skills levels of populations, to identify skills shortages, gaps and mismatches, and to observe labour market trends should be developed. Disaggregated data on participation rates and the outcomes of TVET including graduate transitions, from TVET to work or to further learning and career trajectories, should also be collected.
- 60. TVET information systems should be strengthened and include initiatives to use open data and to bring together existing sources of information on the labour market that can inform TVET policies and programmes as well as people's decisions about their careers. Particular attention should be given to collecting and analysing gender- and age-disaggregated data, as well as data on disadvantaged and marginalized populations.

## Information, guidance and counselling

- 61. Information, guidance and counselling should be offered continuously and directed towards aiding all individuals to make informed educational, training and occupational choices at various stages of life and in support of more complex and diversified careers and working lives.
- 62. Member States should institutionalize information, guidance and counselling mechanisms in order to provide up-to-date and reliable support in relation to education, continuing training and work opportunities at national, regional and international levels.
- 63. Information, guidance and counselling services should support learners and other stakeholders in developing meaningful strategies to utilize social networks and information technologies to inform decision-making.
- 64. Particular attention should be given to promoting equality of opportunity in all its dimensions, including gender equality, so as to address social disparities in education, the world of work and wider society.

# V. MONITORING AND EVALUATION

- 65. TVET policies and programmes should be evaluated in relation to the overall vision, aims and guiding principles of this Recommendation. This could include impact studies of policies and programmes, and investigation of the costs and benefits of TVET for a broad range of actors including individuals, enterprises, societies and Member States.
- 66. Appropriate tools and indicators should be developed for measuring the effectiveness and efficiency of TVET policies against agreed standards, priorities and targets, and that include specific targets for disadvantaged and vulnerable groups. This could include tracer studies and evaluations of institutions and programmes as well as the development of sets of indicators including on access, completion rates and the employment status of graduates.
- 67. Institutional capacities for data collection and the use of information from monitoring and evaluation to inform TVET strategies and programmes, standards and curricula, or to adjust learning methods, should be strengthened. Coherence between national data collection on TVET and international standards and initiatives should be enhanced.
- 68. Processes for monitoring and evaluating TVET should ensure broad participation of relevant stakeholders, with a view to strengthening the connection between findings, decision-making, transparency and accountability for results.

## VI. RESEARCH AND KNOWLEDGE MANAGEMENT

- 69. Member States should encourage TVET research through sustained investment in strengthening research capacity in education and other relevant fields of study. The quality and quantity of TVET research should be improved through diversified sources of funding, incentives and infrastructure, including for tertiary education institutions conducting TVET research. The capacities of stakeholders, including TVET providers and social partners, for research and knowledge management should be developed. Social partners should be involved in commissioning, using and evaluating research, as well as the development of strategies and systems for knowledge management at various levels.
- 70. Inter-disciplinary research, research networks, collaborative research and partnerships should be promoted at local, institutional, sectoral, national, regional and international levels. Appropriate theories, methodologies and research instruments, both qualitative and quantitative, should be developed for studying and researching TVET. TVET research should aim to improve the analysis of contexts and foresight, and provide action-orientated insights. TVET research findings should be widely disseminated through publications and electronic means.

## VII. INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION

- 71. To achieve the vision and objectives of this Recommendation, international cooperation between all countries should be promoted, including through North-South, South-South and triangular cooperation. Member States should enhance cooperation within and across regions as well as between Member States with similar characteristics through various means, including through regional bodies, notably the regional economic communities, the United Nations system and other relevant regional and international entities.
- 72. Civil society organizations and networks should be actively associated with diverse forms of international cooperation relating to TVET.
- 73. Member States should take measures to foster the equitable and inclusive internationalization of TVET. This should be achieved by considering national TVET provision in relation to regional and international provision, and by systematically addressing the need for accountability and transparency regarding particular qualifications and for the recognition of learning experiences carried out in another country or territory. Mutual cooperation and mutual learning between countries should facilitate the mobility of TVET learners and staff. Relevant international or regional guidelines for quality and cross-border provision of TVET, based on shared principles, could be developed.
- 74. Member States can advance international cooperation through knowledge sharing and the identification of best practices and advocacy for TVET, making full use of international and regional networks and other mechanisms for development cooperation, including financing and official development assistance.
- 75. Member States should take advantage of the programmes of the UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre and contribute to the strengthening of the UNEVOC network, both of which promote international cooperation for the development of TVET.
- 76. To facilitate international cooperation, Member States should aim to apply relevant and appropriate internationally-recommended standards and norms, including relevant normative instruments of UNESCO and the International Labour Organization, the International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED), the International Standard Classification of Occupations (ISCO) and the International Standard Industrial Classification (ISIC).

Mechanisms also need to be developed to standardize national and regional occupational standards, and communicate these internationally.

77. Progress by Member States towards the bringing into effect of international recommendations, standards and targets should be continuously evaluated through sustained research, monitoring, periodic reporting and comparative analysis, with a view to enabling countries to use TVET as a means of reducing the disparities within and between countries and creating a more equitable, peaceful and sustainable world.