

Country Specific Recommendations 2018

Assessment, Context and Recommendations of the European Semester in the education and training field

May, 2018



Summary of education-related Country Specific Recommendations 2018

Education and Training CSRs	EU Countries
Improve quality of education and educational outcomes, the educational achievement and level of basic skills of disadvantaged children and students from rural areas, the participation of disadvantaged or minorities and the inclusion of the most disadvantaged (in particular with migrant background) into mainstream education, address regional disparities in education outcomes	AT, BG, CZ, DE, HU, RO, SK, ES

- AT: Improve basic skills for disadvantaged young people and people with a migrant background
- BG: Improve the provision of quality inclusive mainstream education, particularly for Roma and other disadvantaged groups.
- CZ: Strengthen the capacity of the education system to deliver quality inclusive education, including by promoting the teaching profession.
- **DE**: Improve educational outcomes and skills levels of disadvantaged groups.
- HU: Improve education outcomes and increase the participation of disadvantaged groups, in particular Roma, in quality and inclusive mainstream education
- RO: Improve upskilling and the provision of quality mainstream education, in particular for Roma and children in rural areas
- **SK:** Improve the quality and inclusiveness of education, including by increasing the participation of Roma children in mainstream education from early childhood onwards
- ES: Reduce early school leaving and regional disparities in educational outcomes, in particular by better supporting students and teachers

Address skills mismatches and skills shortages to improve	CY, FR, IE, IT, LV, LH, PL, PT,
employability, with a focus on Vocational education and training,	RO, SK, SL, ES, UK
apprenticeship systems, life-long and adult learning and digital	
skills	

- CY: Complete the reform of the education and training system, including teacher evaluation and actions to increase the capacity of vocational education and training.
- FR: Pursue the reforms of the vocational education and training system
- IE: Prioritise the upskilling of the adult working-age population, with a focus on digital skills
- IT: Foster research, innovation, digital skills and infrastructure through better-targeted investment and increase participation in vocational-oriented tertiary education
- LV: Increase the labour market relevance of vocational education and training, and foster upskilling of low-skilled workers and jobseekers
- LT: Improve the quality, efficiency and labour market relevance of education and training, including adult learning
- PL: fostering labour market relevant skills, especially through adult learning



- **PT**: Increase the skills level of the adult population, including digital literacy, by strengthening and broadening the coverage of the training component in adult qualification programmes
- RO: Improve upskilling
- SK: Reinforce activation and upskilling measures, including quality targeted training
- SL: Increase the employability of low-skilled and older workers through lifelong learning
- ES: Increase cooperation between education and businesses with a view to mitigating existing skills mismatches.
- UK: Address skills and progression needs by setting outcome targets for the quality and the
 effectiveness of apprenticeships and by investing more in upskilling those already in the labour
 force

Improve the labour-market relevance of education

HR, LV, LH

- HR: Deliver on the reform of the education and training system to improve its quality and labour market relevance for both young people and adults
- LV: Increase the labour market relevance of vocational education and training
- LT: Improve the quality, efficiency and labour market relevance of education and training

Enhance investment in education and research

DE, NL, ES, UK

- **DE:** Use fiscal and structural policies to achieve a sustained upward trend in public and private investment, and in particular on education, research and innovation
- **NL:** Raise public and private investment in research
- ES: Increase public investment in research
- **UK:** Investing more in upskilling those already in the labour force

Increase private investment in research, enhancing the cooperation between businesses and universities and performance-based funding

EE, DE, LH, NL, ES

- EE: Promote research and innovation, in particular by providing effective incentives for broadening the innovation base
- DE: Use fiscal and structural policies to achieve a sustained upward trend in public and private investment, and in particular on education, research and innovation
- LT: Tackling gaps and inefficiencies in public measures supporting science-industry cooperation.
- NL: To raise public and private investment in research, development and innovation
- ES: Increase cooperation between education and businesses with a view to mitigating existing skills mismatches.

Improve access to quality and affordable early childhood care services

IE, PL, SK

- IE: Ensure the timely and effective implementation of the National Development Plan, including affordable quality childcare.
- PL: improving access to childcare
- SK: Increasing the participation of Roma children in mainstream education from early childhood onwards

Education system reform, quality of teaching, monitoring teachers' performances

BE, HR, CY, FR

- CY: Complete the reform of the education and training system, including teacher evaluation
- CZ: Strengthen the capacity of the education system to deliver quality inclusive education, including by promoting the teaching profession
- ES: Reduce early school leaving and regional disparities in educational outcomes, in particular by better supporting students and teachers



- BE: Pursue the education and training reforms
- **FR:** Pursue the reforms of the vocational education and training system
- HR: Deliver on the reform of the education and training system to improve its quality and labour market relevance for both young people and adults

Research and development

EE, IE, IT, LH, NL, ES

- EE: Promote research and innovation, in particular by providing effective incentives for broadening the innovation base
- IE: stimulating research and innovation with targeted policies
- IT: Foster research, innovation, digital skills and infrastructure through better-targeted investment
- LT: Ensuring efficient governmental coordination of research and innovation policy
- NL: Use fiscal and structural policies to raise public and private investment in research, development and innovation.
- ES: Increase public investment in research and innovation and systematically carry out evaluations of support policies in this area to ensure their effectiveness.

Enhance the efficiency of public services/public spending

AT, BE, BG, CY, LV, LH, PL

- AT: Make public services more efficient, including through aligning financing and spending responsibilities.
- BE: Improve the efficiency and composition of public spending at all levels of government to create room for public investment
- **BG:** Improve tax collection and the efficiency of public spending
- CY: Adopt key legislative reforms to improve efficiency in the public sector
- LV: Strengthen the efficiency of the public sector
- LT: Improve the quality, efficiency and labour market relevance of education and training, including adult learning. Stimulate productivity growth by improving the efficiency of public investment, ensuring efficient governmental coordination of research and innovation policy and tackling gaps and inefficiencies in public measures supporting science-industry cooperation.
- PL: Take steps to improve the efficiency of public spending





Screening of education-related Country Specific Recommendations (CSRs) 2018 and context assessment

EU country Country-specific Recommendations National documents	Assessment and Context	CSR 2018 - 2019
Austria Commission Recommendation DE- EN Country Report 2018 DE - EN National Reform Programme: DE-EN NRP Annex 1: DE - EN NRP Annex 2: DE - EN NRP Annex 3: DE - EN Stability Programme: DE	(15) Learning outcomes for disadvantaged students have not improved. A wide performance gap remains between students with and without a migrant background. National testing in 2016 confirmed that more than 25 % of pupils lack basic skills in German. Recent international testing also confirmed a widening gap in reading for those from a lower socioeconomic or migrant background. [] the proportion of low achievers increased in all three core areas surveyed, i.e. mathematics, reading and science. Austrian-born pupils outperform first generation migrants by a level equivalent to almost 3 years of schooling.	 [] Make public services more efficient, including through aligning financing and spending responsibilities. [] Improve basic skills for disadvantaged young people and people with a migrant background. []
Belgium Commission Recommendation DE - FR - NL - EN Country Report 2018 FR - NL - EN National Reform Programme: FR - NL Stability Programme: FR/NL	(13) There is scope to give spending restraint a larger role in fiscal consolidation. Total public expenditure as a percentage of GDP is above the euro area average [] public investment is low by European standards. [] (18) [] major skills mismatches related to, among other factors, low mobility and inadequate language skills in the Brussels region. Participation in life-long learning is low. More commitments by individuals and employers to continuous life-long learning is important [] (19) Some progress has been made as regards equal opportunities to participate in quality education and vocational training []	 [] Improve the efficiency and composition of public spending at all levels of government to create room for public investment [] [] Pursue the education and training reforms, including by fostering equity and increasing the proportion of graduates in science, technology, engineering and mathematics.





Educational outcomes of 15 year-old pupils show significant variation linked to the socio-economic background and migrant status. The performance differences between communities as well as the underrepresentation of disadvantaged groups among top achievers in science, reading and mathematics are raising concerns. [...] Although the proportion of tertiary education graduates is high, inequalities in access to quality education, skills shortages and regional disparities are seen. The proportion of graduates in science, technology and mathematics is one of the lowest in the EU. [...] Teachers' shortages are raising concerns, [...] There is a need to adapt teachers' continuous professional development. [...]

Bulgaria

Commission Recommendation

BG - EN

Country Report 2018

<u>BG</u> - <u>EN</u>

National Reform Programme: <u>BG</u> - <u>EN</u> Convergence Programme: <u>BG</u> - <u>EN</u>

- (10) [...] The ageing and shrinking population, combined with an activity rate below the EU average, leads to labour and skills shortages, [...] A reinforced focus on upskilling and training would therefore be warranted.
- (11) Inequality of income and access to services (education, healthcare and housing), [...] remain among the highest in the EU. [...] (14) [...] educational outcomes are low and strongly influenced by socio-economic status. Children from disadvantaged families, particularly Roma, do not enjoy equal opportunities. High levels of early school leaving [...]. Providing ethnically mixed kindergartens, schools and classes remains a challenge for the provision of quality inclusive mainstream education. [...] the level of digital skills is still among the lowest in the EU and varies between different socioeconomic groups. [...] the labour market relevance of vocational education and training remains insufficient. [...] addressing skills shortages is a challenge [...] Participation in adult learning is very low in spite of the need for upskilling. In a context of pronounced ageing among teachers, measures to address future shortages have started. [...] teacher education programmes require further strengthening.
- (16) Structural shortcomings and high fragmentation in the research, development and innovation [...] The level of public as well as

- **1.** Improve tax collection and the efficiency of public spending [...]
- **3.** [...] Improve the **provision** of **quality inclusive mainstream education**, particularly for Roma and other **disadvantaged groups**. [...]





	business spending on Research & Development is particularly low. [] While there are many universities and research institutes, only a few of them are producing high quality scientific output. Commercialization of research remains a major weakness. [] Public-private cooperation in research and development is weak.	
Croatia Commission Recommendation HR - EN Country Report 2018 HR - EN National Reform Programme: HR Convergence Programme: HR CP Annex 1: HR	(9) Even though the social dialogue structure in Croatia is in place, the actual interaction between the authorities and stakeholders in the policy preparation process is limited [] (11) Croatia performs below EU average in education investment, early childhood education and care, basic skills, tertiary educational attainment and labour market relevance of vocational education and training in education. [] The reform of school curricula is likely to have a positive impact on the quality of Croatia's education, if it is implemented in full and consistently with the other actions in the strategy. The labour market relevance of vocational education and training programmes appears limited, [] Participation in adult education and educational programmes offered as part of active labour market policy measures are critically low.	2. [] Deliver on the reform of the education and training system to improve its quality and labour market relevance for both young people and adults [] 3. [] In consultation with social partners, introduce harmonised wage-setting frameworks across the public administration and public services []
Cyprus Commission Recommendation EL - EN Country Report 2018 EL - EN National Reform Programme: EN Stability Programme: EN	(15) [] The proportion of young people (aged 15-24) not in employment, education, or training is still one of the highest in the EU. Outreach measures and timely, tailor-made assistance for young people are limited [] (16) The modernisation of the education sector has advanced but important challenges remain. Recent positive developments include a thorough revision of school curricula and the implementation of a new appointment system for teachers. Cyprus' education spending is above the EU average, demonstrating a strong commitment to education, training and life-long learning. However, educational achievements remain poor and early school leaving, while well below the EU average, has increased significantly. Participation in vocational education and training is low, the reform of the teacher evaluation system is still pending []	1. Adopt key legislative reforms to improve efficiency in the public sector [] 5. [] Complete the reform of the education and training system, including teacher evaluation and actions to increase the capacity of vocational education and training.





CSEE		
Czech Republic Commission Recommendation CS - EN Country Report 2018 CS - EN National Reform Programme: CS NRP Annex 1: CS Convergence Programme: CS - EN	(5) [] an expected rebound of public investment and further growth of public wages. [] (12) [] several bottlenecks still hamper the development of a well-performing research and innovation system. The increase of business research and development investment is primarily driven by foreign direct investments. Research and development expenditure by domestic enterprises has declined over the last two years. Despite substantial public research and development investment, the Czech Republic underperforms in terms of the quality of its public science base. [] (13) Quality inclusive education and training are of primary importance [] Education performance continues to be strongly affected by the socioeconomic background of students. Inclusive education measures are still to be fully implemented, in particular for Roma children. Shortages of qualified teachers, [] The planned new career system for teachers, which would have linked continuing professional development, career and salaries, was not adopted []Teachers' salaries remain low compared with those of other workers with tertiary education, but further salary increases are envisaged []The teaching profession therefore remains relatively unattractive [] Finally, the success of the reform to make education more inclusive (introduced in 2016 with the support of the European Social Fund) will depend on the availability of sufficient and sustainable national funding, further teacher and teaching-assistant training, and raising public awareness of the benefits of inclusive education. (14) [] In 2016, only 4.7 % of children below the age of three were in formal childcare. []	2. [] Strengthen the capacity of the education system to deliver quality inclusive education, including by promoting the teaching profession. []
Denmark Commission Recommendation DA - EN Country Report 2018 DA - EN	(6) []Reforms to increase participation and completion rates in vocational education and training and measures to better develop digital skills levels are likely to increase the supply of skilled workers [] The integration of children with a migrant background in the	/





National Reform Programme: <u>DA</u> - <u>EN</u> Convergence Programme: <u>DA</u> - <u>EN</u>	education system remains a key challenge , resulting in a lower education performance on average compared to other children.	
Estonia Commission Recommendation EN Country Report 2018 ET - EN National Reform Programme : EN NRP Annex 1: EN Stability Programme : ET	(10) [] Public sector expenditure on research, technology and innovation has traditionally been above the European Union average. []	2. Promote research and innovation, in particular by providing effective incentives for broadening the innovation base.
Finland Commission Recommendation FI - SV - EN Country Report 2018 FI - EN National Reform Programme: FI - SV - EN Stability Programme: SV - EN	 (12) [] could provide an opportunity to improve the efficiency of public services [] (13) Wage setting practices are changing and moving towards sectoral and local level bargaining. [] (14) []need for continued investment in adult learning and vocational training to enable occupational mobility and reduce skills mismatches. 	
France Commission Recommendation FR - EN Country Report 2018 FR - EN National Reform Programme: FR NPR Annex 1: FR Stability Programme: FR	(9) The level of public expenditure in France is the highest in the EU. [] (11) [] the impact of socioeconomic and migrant background on educational performance is comparatively high [] (12) [] important to finalise the implementation of the ongoing ambitious reform programme, [] the reform of the vocational education and training system, including apprenticeships. (15) The current initial vocational education and training system does not sufficiently support labour market integration [] French students in vocational education and training achieve much lower educational outcomes than the EU average, while those in general education perform much better. In this context, measures to foster apprenticeships, which are associated with better employment	1. Ensure that the nominal growth rate of net primary government expenditure does not exceed 1.4 % in 2019 [] 2. Pursue the reforms of the vocational education and training system, []





prospects, along with measures to improve school-based results, are essential [...] **improving access** to **continuous training** for the low qualified workers and jobseekers and promoting the achievement of higher qualifications, backed by appropriate training guidance, are also important. [...] the intention to implement a EUR 14 billion **investment plan** for **skills** and opens the way for a complementary reform of the school-based initial vocational education.

(19) According to the European Innovation Scoreboard, France's innovation performance remains below that of EU innovation leaders, despite the relatively high level of public support. In particular, improving the efficiency of public support schemes (including the *Crédit d'Impôt Recherche*, tax credit for research and development) would stimulate better innovation output. In this respect, the results of ongoing evaluations need to be fed into improvements to the design of public support for innovation. **Knowledge transfer** between public research and businesses remains a challenge and this limits the commercial exploitation of research results. Compared with other EU countries, France's performance is low in public-private copublications and public R&D financed by businesses.[...]

<u>Germany</u>

Commission Recommendation

DE - EN

Country Report 2018

DE - EN

National Reform Programme: <u>DE</u> Stability Programme: <u>DE</u> - <u>EN</u>

- (3) [...]While a number of measures have been taken to strengthen public investment, these efforts have **not** yet resulted in a **sustainable upward trend** in **public investment** as a share of GDP. [...]
- (7) [...] Public investment is picking up, but as a proportion of GDP the increase is still modest [...]
- (8) Public expenditure on education remained at 4.2 % of GDP in 2016, below the EU average of 4.7 %. Spending on education and research remained at 9.0 % of GDP in 2016, falling short of the national target of 10 %. [...] While education expenditure has increased in real terms, a considerable investment backlog remains. At the same time, challenges such as growing student numbers, teacher shortages and further expansion of early childhood education and care will require appropriate public financing.
- 1. [...] use fiscal and structural policies to achieve a sustained upward trend in public and private investment, and in particular on education, research and innovation [...]
- 2. [...] Create conditions to promote higher wage growth, while respecting the role of the social partners. Improve educational outcomes and skills levels of disadvantaged groups.





Additional spending on education and on research and innovation is crucial for Germany's potential growth

(17) Socio-economic background remains a considerable determinant of educational outcomes and labour market integration. In science, it contributes to a performance difference of 3 years of schooling between the lowest and highest social quartiles [...] National data confirm the substantial correlation also for primary education. Particular challenges exist for students with a migrant background. Compared with native-born students, they are much more likely to underachieve in basic skills and leave school early or drop out of university. [...] adult learning is below the EU average and remains a particular challenge for the low-skilled adult population of 7.5 million people who lack basic reading and writing skills.

Hungary

Commission Recommendation

<u>EN</u>

Country Report 2018

<u>HU</u> - <u>EN</u>

National Reform Programme

HU - EN

NRP Annex 1: EN - HU

Convergence Programme: HU

- (9) [...] The level of participation in childcare for children under the age of 3 is well under the Barcelona target and the EU average.[...]
- (11) The Hungarian social dialogue structures and processes remain underdeveloped and do not allow for a meaningful involvement of social partners in policy design and implementation.[...]
- (15) Education outcomes for basic skills are significantly below the EU average, especially for children from disadvantaged socioeconomic background. Pupils are streamed early into different types of schools, with wide gaps in education outcomes and employment paths. Disadvantaged children, including Roma children, tend to be concentrated in vocational secondary schools which are characterised by poorer levels of basic skills and higher dropout rates, [...] The early school leaving rate increased to 12.4 % on average, and is particularly high among Roma children. These challenges are especially pressing in the context of quality and inclusive education. The shrinking pool of applicants and high dropout rates in tertiary education will further limit attainment rates[...]
- **1.** [...] In 2019, ensure that the nominal growth rate of net primary government expenditure does not exceed 3.9 %, [...]
- 3. [...] Improve education outcomes and increase the participation of disadvantaged groups, in particular Roma, in quality and inclusive mainstream education.[...]





Ireland

Commission Recommendation

EN

Country Report 2018

ΕN

National Reform Programme: <u>EN</u> Stability Programme: <u>EN</u>

- **(9)** Public finances have further improved on the back of robust output growth, yet risks of revenue volatility remain [...]
- (15) Access to affordable, full-time and quality childcare remains a challenge. Childcare costs in Ireland relative to wages were in 2015 the highest in the EU for lone parents and the second highest in the EU for couples. [...]
- (16) [...] skills mismatches and skills shortages are becoming more evident in several areas. This accentuates the need to accelerate upskilling and reskilling policies and measures. Ireland has in particular a low level of participation in life-long learning [...] Ireland has overall one of the lowest levels of digital skills in the EU, which is in stark contrast to the high proportion of science, technology, engineering and mathematics graduates leaving the Irish higher education system. [...]
- 2. Ensure the timely and effective implementation of the National Development Plan, including [...] affordable quality childcare. Prioritise the upskilling of the adult working-age population, with a focus on digital skills.
- **3.** [...] **stimulating research** and innovation with targeted policies,

<u>Italy</u>

Commission Recommendation

ΕN

Country Report 2018

IT - EN

National Reform Programme: IT
Stability Programme: IT

- (11) [...] growth-enhancing spending items like education, whose share in expenditure has been declining since the early 2000s. [...]
- **(21)** [...] At 20.1 % in 2017, the **proportion** of young people **not** in **employment, education or training** was still **among the highest** in the EU, with wide and persistent regional differences.
- (25) [...] The overall quality of schooling in Italy is improving, but wide regional differences persist. The proportion of students leaving school without a diploma remains above the EU average [...] particularly among foreign-born students. Implementation of the school reform is broadly on track, and vocational education and training is improving. Tertiary education, severely underfunded with public spending accounting for less than 0.4 % of GDP, is characterised by high drop-out rates and prolonged study periods. [...] educational attainment is one of the lowest in the EU [...] The participation rate in adult learning programmes is increasing but it still remains among the lowest in the EU, especially for low-skilled adults. Upskilling and reskilling should be fostered [...]
- **1**. Ensure that the nominal growth rate of net primary government expenditure does not exceed 0.1 % in 2019 [...]
- **4.** [...] **increasing** the coverage of **childcare facilities**. **Foster research**, innovation, **digital skills** and infrastructure through better-targeted investment and **increase participation** in **vocational-oriented tertiary education**.





Latvia

Commission Recommendation

LV - EN

Country Report 2018

LV - EN

National Reform Programme: <u>LV</u> - <u>EN</u> Stability Programme: <u>LV</u> - <u>EN</u> (11) [...] Curriculum reform in vocational education and training aimed at aligning education with contemporary skills requirements has progressed. However, further efforts are needed to fully implement the reform and increase participation in both initial and continuous vocational education and training. The implementation of the new work-based learning approach has started, with the involvement of social partners and companies. However, few students are enrolled in the scheme. Adult participation in learning has increased only slightly [...] In a broader context, strengthening social partners' capacity is important to foster their engagement

- **2.** [...] Increase the labour market relevance of **vocational education and training**, and **foster upskilling** of low-skilled workers and jobseekers. [...]
- **3**. Strengthen the efficiency of the public sector, [...]

Lithuania

Commission Recommendation

LT - EN

Country Report 2018

<u>LT - EN</u>

National Reform Programme: <u>LT</u> - <u>EN</u>

NRP Annex 1: <u>LT</u> - <u>EN</u> Stability Programme : <u>LT</u> (10) [...] Such a situation demands an education and training system able to provide everybody with the relevant skills. [...] The financing and accreditation rules in Lithuania's tertiary education are helping to increase the number of people with tertiary education, but at the same time have contributed to concerns about its quality, fragmentation and labour market relevance. [...] made more urgent the need to provide equitable access to quality and inclusive education. To address the below-average performance of Lithuania's pupils in basic skills, reforms are needed in teachers' initial training, careers and working conditions, [...]

(11) The low participation of adults in learning in Lithuania indicates that adult learning remains underdeveloped [...]

the **content of** the **vocational education and training** curriculum is often **outdated**, [...] **Work-based learning** is still at the initial phase and could be expanded.[...] **strengthening social partners' capacity** is important to foster their engagement.

(14) [...] Only limited progress has been made in improving the efficiency of public investment. In particular, the efficiency of public R&D expenditure and the cooperation between businesses and science remain low. Moreover, public investment in research and development dropped significantly in 2016.[...]

- 2. Improve the quality, efficiency and labour market relevance of education and training, including adult learning [...]
- 3. Stimulate productivity growth by improving the efficiency of public investment, ensuring efficient governmental coordination of research and innovation policy and tackling gaps and inefficiencies in public measures supporting science-industry cooperation.





Luxembourg Commission Recommendation FR - DE - EN Country Report 2018 FR - EN National Reform Programme: FR - EN NRP Annex 1: FR NRP Annex 2: FR Stability Programme: EN - FR	(9) Between [] 2000 and 2016, Luxembourg has increased its public R&D expenditure fivefold, reaching 0.60 % of GDP. These investments have led the country to rapidly build a well-performing public research system. However, while public R&D investment is above the euro-area average, private investment in R&D and innovation performance, as measured by the European innovation scoreboard, has continued to decline [] (13) [] Luxembourg needs to address the strong impact of students' socioeconomic background on their education outcomes. []	/
Malta Commission Recommendation EN - MT Country Report 2018 MT - EN National Reform Programme: EN NRP Annex 1: EN NRP Annex 2: EN NRP Annex 3: EN Stability Programme: EN	(9) [] Labour shortages are growing and skills mismatches persist. [] (10) At 18.6 % in 2017, the early school leaving rate remains the highest in the EU and with little improvement compared to the previous year. Malta also has the highest early school leaving rate for people with disabilities, which is at 50 %, double the EU average. Moreover, learning outcomes are strongly influenced by socioeconomic background, type of school and disability status. The gap in science performance between students from the bottom versus the top performing schools is among the highest in the EU []The share of low achievers in maths, science and reading is the fourth highest in the EU. A comprehensive strategy to improve educational quality and reduce inequalities in educational outcomes between social groups and different school types is missing.	
The Netherlands Commission Recommendation NL - EN Country Report 2018 NL - EN National Reform Programme: NL - EN Stability Programme: NL - EN	(7) The Netherlands has an efficient research and development sector and the country's high-performing education system and scientific base provide a sound basis for boosting innovation and growth capacity through education and research and development activities. Substantial additional investment has been announced which could help to stabilise public and private research and development intensity. Whether the Netherlands will reach its	1. While respecting the medium-term objective, use fiscal and structural policies to raise public and private investment in research, development and innovation. [] 2. Reduce the incentives to use temporary contracts and self-employed





Contribution from the social partners to the National Reform Programme: NL - EN	Europe 2020 targets, notably on investment in research and development and renewable energy, remains uncertain.	without employees, while promoting adequate social protection for the self-employed, and tackle bogus self-employment. Create conditions to promote higher wage growth, respecting the role of the social partners. Ensure that the second pillar of the pension system is more transparent, inter-generationally fairer and more resilient to shocks.
Poland Commission Recommendation EN Country Report 2018 PL - EN National Reform Programme: PL - EN Convergence Programme: PL	(9) [] the formal childcare enrolment rate for children under the age of three remains among the lowest in the EU.[] (10) [] The rate of adult's participation in education and training is much lower than the EU average. [] certain weaknesses in digital skills, as well as in literacy and numeracy skills, particularly among adults with below-tertiary education[] changes in the organisation of general education, vocational education and higher education, will have an impact on skill levels is not yet known. (14) [] providing incentives for business expenditure on research and development, strengthening the science base including through reforms of tertiary education and encouraging a strong flow of knowledge and close co-operation between business and research institutions. The latter also involves ensuring favourable conditions for the commercialisation of research, developed and supported by public funding	 Ensure that the nominal growth rate of net primary government expenditure does not exceed 4.2 % in 2019, [] Take steps to improve the efficiency of public spending, [] [] improving access to childcare and by fostering labour market relevant skills, especially through adult learning, [] [] supporting closer collaboration between business and research institutions. []
Portugal Commission Recommendation PT - EN Country Report 2018 PT - EN National Reform Programme: PT NRP Annex 1 Part 1: PT	(8) [] ensure that the nominal growth rate of net primary government expenditure does not exceed 0.1 % in 2018[] (14) The overall skills level of the adult population remains among the lowest in Europe, hampering the country's innovation potential and competitiveness. This includes digital skills: in 2017, only 50 % of citizens aged 16-74 possessed basic or above basic digital skills	 Ensure that the nominal growth rate of net primary government expenditure does not exceed 0.7 % in 2019,[] [] reviewing the legal framework in consultation with social partners. Increase the skills level of the adult





NRP Annex 1 Part 2: PT NRP Annex 1 Part 3: PT

NRP Annex 3: PT

Stability Programme: PT - EN

(against an EU average of 57 %). Programmes are being rolled out in this regard [...]

(15) Early school leaving remains higher than the EU average, but it is on a long-term downward trend, [...] Educational outcomes continue to improve, but there are equity concerns as proportions of low achievers differ significantly between the bottom and the top socioeconomic quartiles. Attainment in tertiary education (age 30-34) decreased [...] science, engineering, technology, and mathematics graduates, there is low student uptake in these fields.

(16) [...] significant bottlenecks remain in creating a culture and the enabling conditions for stronger academia-business cooperation. These include barriers to knowledge and technology transfer, commercialisation of research outputs as well as research career tracks that do not sufficiently incentivise researchers to explore the avenues of "entrepreneurial research" [...]

population, including digital literacy, by strengthening and broadening the coverage of the training component in adult qualification programmes. Improve higher education uptake, namely in science and technology fields.

Romania

Commission Recommendation FN

Country Report 2018

<u>RO</u> - <u>EN</u>

National Reform Programme: <u>RO</u> Convergence Programme: <u>RO</u> - <u>EN</u> (13) The involvement of social partners in the design and implementation of economic and social reforms has been very limited. The views of social partners are frequently not taken into account even when they converge. Romania's collective bargaining framework is not conducive to a well-functioning system of industrial relations [...]

- (15) low attainment levels in basic skills and digital skills [...] Participation in adult learning has been very low. [...] Vocational education and training remains a second choice option and is not sufficiently aligned with labour market needs [...]
- (16) The weak performance of the education system contributes to the high inequality of opportunity and Romania's long-run growth prospects. The provision of and access to quality inclusive mainstream education is a challenge, in particular for Roma and children in rural areas. [...] The rate of early leavers from education and training is decreasing but still high. [...] quality assurance in school and higher education is faced with challenges. Tertiary education

2. [...] Improve upskilling and the provision of **quality mainstream education**, in particular for Roma and children in rural areas. [...]





	attainment is very low. Investment in education is relatively low, and disadvantaged schools in particular are lacking appropriate support.	
Slovakia Commission Recommendation SK - EN Country Report 2018 SK - EN National Reform Programme: SK National Reform Programme Action Plan: SK Stability Programme: SK	(12) [] Training and requalification programmes have been strengthened but are still insufficient [] adult participation in learning is still very low and second-chance education for disadvantaged groups is underdeveloped [] (13) [] Particularly for children under the age of three, the enrolment rates in childcare are extremely low (14) The education system does not sufficiently contribute to the socioeconomic development of Slovakia, and is underfunded at all levels. The quality of educational outcomes, the participation of Roma in inclusive mainstream education and the effective integration of students from socioeconomically disadvantaged backgrounds in education and training are pressing challenges. Educational outcomes and the level of basic skills remain weak by international standards and are profoundly impacted by students' socioeconomic background. Early school leaving is low but increasing [] Despite plans to annually increase teacher salaries by 6% until 2020, the teaching profession is still unattractive, in part due to limited initial training and professional development opportunities. [] (22) [] business research and development intensity which is very low [] (23) Public investments in research and innovation increased strongly between 2009 and 2015 [] cooperation between businesses and academia are advancing only slowly	1. Ensure that the nominal growth rate of net primary government expenditure does not exceed 4.1 % in 2019 [] 2. Reinforce activation and upskilling measures, including quality targeted training [] extending affordable, quality childcare. Improve the quality and inclusiveness of education, including by increasing the participation of Roma children in mainstream education from early childhood onwards
Slovenia Commission Recommendation EN Country Report 2018 SL - EN	(12) [] the need to increase participation in adult learning which has been falling since 2010 [] Improving skills through lifelong learning would increase the chances of employment,[]	1. Ensure that the nominal growth rate of net primary government expenditure does not exceed 3.1 % in 2019 [] Increase the employability of low-skilled





National Reform Programme: <u>SL</u> - <u>EN</u> Stability Programme: <u>SL</u> - <u>EN</u>		and older workers through lifelong learning []
Spain Commission Recommendation EN Country Report 2018 EN - ES National Reform Programme: ES Stability Programme: ES SP Annex 1: ES SP Annex 2: ES SP Annex 3: ES	(11) [] The involvement of social partners in policy design has increased recently but there is still room for further improvement. (13) [] hampered by persistently subdued levels of investment in research and development, which make reaching the national Europe 2020 research and development intensity target of 2 % very unlikely.[] (14) [] early school leaving rates are well above the EU average. Together with educational outcomes, they vary greatly across regions and may affect equality of opportunities. [] the professional development of teachers is to be supported by reducing temporary employment contracts and increased resources for their training [] Greater cooperation between education and business could boost labour market access of young graduates, [] the proposal for a new national digital strategy acknowledges the need to improve digital skills.	 [] ensure that the nominal growth rate of net primary government expenditure does not exceed 0.6% in 2019 [] [] Reduce early school leaving and regional disparities in educational outcomes, in particular by better supporting students and teachers. [] Increase public investment in research and innovation and systematically carry out evaluations of support policies in this area to ensure their effectiveness. Increase cooperation between education and businesses with a view to mitigating existing skills mismatches.
Sweden Commission Recommendation EN Country Report 2018 SV - EN National Reform Programme: SV- EN NRP Annex 1: EN - SV Convergence Programme : SV - EN	(9) [] The educational performance gap between pupils from different socioeconomic backgrounds is widening. The integration of newly arrived migrant pupils into the school system warrants close monitoring, as does the growing shortage of teachers.	/





United Kingdom

Commission Recommendation

FΝ

Country Report 2018

E١

National Reform Programme: <u>EN</u> Convergence Programme: <u>EN</u> (10) [...] On skills, much of the focus thus far has been on apprenticeships and reforms to technical education [...] the United Kingdom is among those Member States that already meet over two-thirds of the draft criteria in the European Framework for Quality and Effective Apprenticeships, and therefore setting and monitoring quality targets, e.g. via graduate tracking, is feasible. Resources commensurate with those earmarked for apprenticeships and the new T-Levels for school leavers are needed for lifelong learning options, [...]

(11) [...] Childcare reforms are being rolled out, but more provision may be needed, particularly for children under three. [...]

- **1.** Ensure that the nominal growth rate of net primary government expenditure does not exceed 1.6 % in 2019-2020 [...]
- **3.** Address skills and progression needs by **setting outcome targets** for the **quality and the effectiveness** of **apprenticeships** and by **investing more** in **upskilling** those already in the labour force [...]